

**The Role of the Judiciary and Civil Society in the Implementation of Constitutional
Rule of Law in the Russian Federation**

Dr. Skuratoa

National University of Oil and Gas UK

Prof, Dr. Dzhavakhy

National University of Oil and Gas UK

Abstract

The need for maintaining constitutional legal order as a sign of how law and legality are embodied in the control of social relations, as well as the role of the judicial system and civil society institutions in ensuring the supremacy of the Constitution as the most crucial prerequisite for the establishment of a constitutional state, attest to the topic's applicability. In order to ensure justice as the most important safeguard of citizens' rights and freedoms, as well as their associations, as a necessary prerequisite for ensuring and maintaining constitutional legal order, the article's purpose is to develop conceptual positions on the relationships of various public institutions (state and non-state). The examination of the judiciary's function in its dialectical interaction with them.

Introduction

UN experts* today expressed alarm over the escalating crackdown against civil society by Russian authorities after the decision by the Moscow city court this week to liquidate Moscow Helsinki Group, a prominent human rights organisation. "The authorities must immediately halt all acts of repression, judicial harassment and intimidation against civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets and respect their rights to freedom of association, peaceful assembly and of expression," the experts said. They saw the decision, based on the referral of the Ministry of Justice, to forcibly dissolve one of the oldest and most prominent human rights groups in the country as the latest example of clampdown on human rights organisations in Russia. In the recent past, several human rights organisations have been similarly liquidated, including the International Memorial and Human Rights Centre Memorial (known as the Memorial).

“The decision to dissolve Moscow Helsinki Group illustrates again that Russian authorities continue to disregard their obligations under international human rights law to respect the right to freedom of association. The allegations raised by authorities in these proceedings appear to be disproportionate and punish the organisation for its legitimate human rights work,” the experts said. “Such acts of reprisal, harassment and intimidation foster a climate of fear, preventing civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets from exercising their rights freely and safely.”

The UN experts noted that over the past decade, the erosion of the rule of law, human rights protection and democracy has continued at an alarming pace in Russia. Despite repeated calls from UN human rights experts and the international community to end restrictive measures, authorities have increased their crackdown on civic space, making it extremely difficult and dangerous for human rights defenders and civil society organisations to carry out their legitimate work.

“Russian authorities must end their campaign to silence dissenting voices,” the experts said. They urged Russia to stop stigmatising civil society actors and human rights defenders as ‘foreign agents’ and end their harassment, criminalisation and imprisonment, the forced dissolution of human rights organisations, and severe restrictions on the freedoms of expression, peaceful assembly and association. “Their work is essential to ensure accountability for victims of human rights violations in Russia and promote rule of law and democracy in the country.” The experts said they would continue to monitor the situation of civic space in the country and to advise the authorities on their human rights obligations.

UN experts* today expressed alarm over the escalating crackdown against civil society by Russian authorities after the decision by the Moscow city court this week to liquidate Moscow Helsinki Group, a prominent human rights organisation. “The authorities must immediately halt all acts of repression, judicial harassment and intimidation against civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets and respect their rights to freedom of association, peaceful assembly and of expression,” the experts said. They

saw the decision, based on the referral of the Ministry of Justice, to forcibly dissolve one of the oldest and most prominent human rights groups in the country as the latest example of clampdown on human rights organisations in Russia. In the recent past, several human rights organisations have been similarly liquidated, including the International Memorial and Human Rights Centre Memorial (known as the Memorial).

“The decision to dissolve Moscow Helsinki Group illustrates again that Russian authorities continue to disregard their obligations under international human rights law to respect the right to freedom of association. The allegations raised by authorities in these proceedings appear to be disproportionate and punish the organisation for its legitimate human rights work,” the experts said. “Such acts of reprisal, harassment and intimidation foster a climate of fear, preventing civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets from exercising their rights freely and safely.”

The UN experts noted that over the past decade, the erosion of the rule of law, human rights protection and democracy has continued at an alarming pace in Russia. Despite repeated calls from UN human rights experts and the international community to end restrictive measures, authorities have increased their crackdown on civic space, making it extremely difficult and dangerous for human rights defenders and civil society organisations to carry out their legitimate work.

“Russian authorities must end their campaign to silence dissenting voices,” the experts said. They urged Russia to stop stigmatising civil society actors and human rights defenders as ‘foreign agents’ and end their harassment, criminalisation and imprisonment, the forced dissolution of human rights organisations, and severe restrictions on the freedoms of expression, peaceful assembly and association. “Their work is essential to ensure accountability for victims of human rights violations in Russia and promote rule of law and democracy in the country.” The experts said they would continue to monitor the situation of civic space in the country and to advise the authorities on their human rights obligations.

UN experts* today expressed alarm over the escalating crackdown against civil society by Russian authorities after the decision by the Moscow city court this week to liquidate Moscow Helsinki Group, a prominent human rights organisation. “The authorities must immediately halt all acts of repression, judicial harassment and intimidation against civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets and respect their rights to freedom of association, peaceful assembly and of expression,” the experts said. They saw the decision, based on the referral of the Ministry of Justice, to forcibly dissolve one of the oldest and most prominent human rights groups in the country as the latest example of clampdown on human rights organisations in Russia. In the recent past, several human rights organisations have been similarly liquidated, including the International Memorial and Human Rights Centre Memorial (known as the Memorial). “The decision to dissolve Moscow Helsinki Group illustrates again that Russian authorities continue to disregard their obligations under international human rights law to respect the right to freedom of association. The allegations raised by authorities in these proceedings appear to be disproportionate and punish the organisation for its legitimate human rights work,” the experts said. “Such acts of reprisal, harassment and intimidation foster a climate of fear, preventing civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets from exercising their rights freely and safely.”

The UN experts noted that over the past decade, the erosion of the rule of law, human rights protection and democracy has continued at an alarming pace in Russia. Despite repeated calls from UN human rights experts and the international community to end restrictive measures, authorities have increased their crackdown on civic space, making it extremely difficult and dangerous for human rights defenders and civil society organisations to carry out their legitimate work.

“Russian authorities must end their campaign to silence dissenting voices,” the experts said. They urged Russia to stop stigmatising civil society actors and human rights defenders as ‘foreign agents’ and end their harassment, criminalisation and imprisonment, the forced dissolution of human rights organisations, and severe

restrictions on the freedoms of expression, peaceful assembly and association. "Their work is essential to ensure accountability for victims of human rights violations in Russia and promote rule of law and democracy in the country." The experts said they would continue to monitor the situation of civic space in the country and to advise the authorities on their human rights obligations.

UN experts* today expressed alarm over the escalating crackdown against civil society by Russian authorities after the decision by the Moscow city court this week to liquidate Moscow Helsinki Group, a prominent human rights organisation. "The authorities must immediately halt all acts of repression, judicial harassment and intimidation against civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets and respect their rights to freedom of association, peaceful assembly and of expression," the experts said. They saw the decision, based on the referral of the Ministry of Justice, to forcibly dissolve one of the oldest and most prominent human rights groups in the country as the latest example of clampdown on human rights organisations in Russia. In the recent past, several human rights organisations have been similarly liquidated, including the International Memorial and Human Rights Centre Memorial (known as the Memorial). "The decision to dissolve Moscow Helsinki Group illustrates again that Russian authorities continue to disregard their obligations under international human rights law to respect the right to freedom of association. The allegations raised by authorities in these proceedings appear to be disproportionate and punish the organisation for its legitimate human rights work," the experts said. "Such acts of reprisal, harassment and intimidation foster a climate of fear, preventing civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets from exercising their rights freely and safely."

The UN experts noted that over the past decade, the erosion of the rule of law, human rights protection and democracy has continued at an alarming pace in Russia. Despite repeated calls from UN human rights experts and the international community to end restrictive measures, authorities have increased their crackdown on civic space, making

it extremely difficult and dangerous for human rights defenders and civil society organisations to carry out their legitimate work.

“Russian authorities must end their campaign to silence dissenting voices,” the experts said. They urged Russia to stop stigmatising civil society actors and human rights defenders as ‘foreign agents’ and end their harassment, criminalisation and imprisonment, the forced dissolution of human rights organisations, and severe restrictions on the freedoms of expression, peaceful assembly and association. “Their work is essential to ensure accountability for victims of human rights violations in Russia and promote rule of law and democracy in the country.” The experts said they would continue to monitor the situation of civic space in the country and to advise the authorities on their human rights obligations.

UN experts* today expressed alarm over the escalating crackdown against civil society by Russian authorities after the decision by the Moscow city court this week to liquidate Moscow Helsinki Group, a prominent human rights organisation. “The authorities must immediately halt all acts of repression, judicial harassment and intimidation against civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets and respect their rights to freedom of association, peaceful assembly and of expression,” the experts said. They saw the decision, based on the referral of the Ministry of Justice, to forcibly dissolve one of the oldest and most prominent human rights groups in the country as the latest example of clampdown on human rights organisations in Russia. In the recent past, several human rights organisations have been similarly liquidated, including the International Memorial and Human Rights Centre Memorial (known as the Memorial).

“The decision to dissolve Moscow Helsinki Group illustrates again that Russian authorities continue to disregard their obligations under international human rights law to respect the right to freedom of association. The allegations raised by authorities in these proceedings appear to be disproportionate and punish the organisation for its legitimate human rights work,” the experts said. “Such acts of reprisal, harassment and intimidation

foster a climate of fear, preventing civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets from exercising their rights freely and safely.”

The UN experts noted that over the past decade, the erosion of the rule of law, human rights protection and democracy has continued at an alarming pace in Russia. Despite repeated calls from UN human rights experts and the international community to end restrictive measures, authorities have increased their crackdown on civic space, making it extremely difficult and dangerous for human rights defenders and civil society organisations to carry out their legitimate work.

“Russian authorities must end their campaign to silence dissenting voices,” the experts said. They urged Russia to stop stigmatising civil society actors and human rights defenders as ‘foreign agents’ and end their harassment, criminalisation and imprisonment, the forced dissolution of human rights organisations, and severe restrictions on the freedoms of expression, peaceful assembly and association. “Their work is essential to ensure accountability for victims of human rights violations in Russia and promote rule of law and democracy in the country.” The experts said they would continue to monitor the situation of civic space in the country and to advise the authorities on their human rights obligations.

UN experts* today expressed alarm over the escalating crackdown against civil society by Russian authorities after the decision by the Moscow city court this week to liquidate Moscow Helsinki Group, a prominent human rights organisation. “The authorities must immediately halt all acts of repression, judicial harassment and intimidation against civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets and respect their rights to freedom of association, peaceful assembly and of expression,” the experts said. They saw the decision, based on the referral of the Ministry of Justice, to forcibly dissolve one of the oldest and most prominent human rights groups in the country as the latest example of clampdown on human rights organisations in Russia. In the recent past, several human rights organisations have been similarly liquidated, including the International Memorial and Human Rights Centre Memorial (known as the Memorial).

“The decision to dissolve Moscow Helsinki Group illustrates again that Russian authorities continue to disregard their obligations under international human rights law to respect the right to freedom of association. The allegations raised by authorities in these proceedings appear to be disproportionate and punish the organisation for its legitimate human rights work,” the experts said. “Such acts of reprisal, harassment and intimidation foster a climate of fear, preventing civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets from exercising their rights freely and safely.”

The UN experts noted that over the past decade, the erosion of the rule of law, human rights protection and democracy has continued at an alarming pace in Russia. Despite repeated calls from UN human rights experts and the international community to end restrictive measures, authorities have increased their crackdown on civic space, making it extremely difficult and dangerous for human rights defenders and civil society organisations to carry out their legitimate work.

“Russian authorities must end their campaign to silence dissenting voices,” the experts said. They urged Russia to stop stigmatising civil society actors and human rights defenders as ‘foreign agents’ and end their harassment, criminalisation and imprisonment, the forced dissolution of human rights organisations, and severe restrictions on the freedoms of expression, peaceful assembly and association. “Their work is essential to ensure accountability for victims of human rights violations in Russia and promote rule of law and democracy in the country.” The experts said they would continue to monitor the situation of civic space in the country and to advise the authorities on their human rights obligations.

UN experts* today expressed alarm over the escalating crackdown against civil society by Russian authorities after the decision by the Moscow city court this week to liquidate Moscow Helsinki Group, a prominent human rights organisation. “The authorities must immediately halt all acts of repression, judicial harassment and intimidation against civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets and respect their rights to freedom of association, peaceful assembly and of expression,” the experts said. They

saw the decision, based on the referral of the Ministry of Justice, to forcibly dissolve one of the oldest and most prominent human rights groups in the country as the latest example of clampdown on human rights organisations in Russia. In the recent past, several human rights organisations have been similarly liquidated, including the International Memorial and Human Rights Centre Memorial (known as the Memorial).

“The decision to dissolve Moscow Helsinki Group illustrates again that Russian authorities continue to disregard their obligations under international human rights law to respect the right to freedom of association. The allegations raised by authorities in these proceedings appear to be disproportionate and punish the organisation for its legitimate human rights work,” the experts said. “Such acts of reprisal, harassment and intimidation foster a climate of fear, preventing civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets from exercising their rights freely and safely.”

The UN experts noted that over the past decade, the erosion of the rule of law, human rights protection and democracy has continued at an alarming pace in Russia. Despite repeated calls from UN human rights experts and the international community to end restrictive measures, authorities have increased their crackdown on civic space, making it extremely difficult and dangerous for human rights defenders and civil society organisations to carry out their legitimate work.

“Russian authorities must end their campaign to silence dissenting voices,” the experts said. They urged Russia to stop stigmatising civil society actors and human rights defenders as ‘foreign agents’ and end their harassment, criminalisation and imprisonment, the forced dissolution of human rights organisations, and severe restrictions on the freedoms of expression, peaceful assembly and association. “Their work is essential to ensure accountability for victims of human rights violations in Russia and promote rule of law and democracy in the country.” The experts said they would continue to monitor the situation of civic space in the country and to advise the authorities on their human rights obligations.

UN experts* today expressed alarm over the escalating crackdown against civil society by Russian authorities after the decision by the Moscow city court this week to liquidate Moscow Helsinki Group, a prominent human rights organisation. “The authorities must immediately halt all acts of repression, judicial harassment and intimidation against civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets and respect their rights to freedom of association, peaceful assembly and of expression,” the experts said. They saw the decision, based on the referral of the Ministry of Justice, to forcibly dissolve one of the oldest and most prominent human rights groups in the country as the latest example of clampdown on human rights organisations in Russia. In the recent past, several human rights organisations have been similarly liquidated, including the International Memorial and Human Rights Centre Memorial (known as the Memorial). “The decision to dissolve Moscow Helsinki Group illustrates again that Russian authorities continue to disregard their obligations under international human rights law to respect the right to freedom of association. The allegations raised by authorities in these proceedings appear to be disproportionate and punish the organisation for its legitimate human rights work,” the experts said. “Such acts of reprisal, harassment and intimidation foster a climate of fear, preventing civil society organisations, human rights defenders and media outlets from exercising their rights freely and safely.”

The UN experts noted that over the past decade, the erosion of the rule of law, human rights protection and democracy has continued at an alarming pace in Russia. Despite repeated calls from UN human rights experts and the international community to end restrictive measures, authorities have increased their crackdown on civic space, making it extremely difficult and dangerous for human rights defenders and civil society organisations to carry out their legitimate work.

“Russian authorities must end their campaign to silence dissenting voices,” the experts said. They urged Russia to stop stigmatising civil society actors and human rights defenders as ‘foreign agents’ and end their harassment, criminalisation and imprisonment, the forced dissolution of human rights organisations, and severe

restrictions on the freedoms of expression, peaceful assembly and association. "Their work is essential to ensure accountability for victims of human rights violations in Russia and promote rule of law and democracy in the country." The experts said they would continue to monitor the situation of civic space in the country and to advise the authorities on their human rights obligations.

Reference

1. Anishina, V.I. and Gadzhiev, G.A., (2006). Independence of the judiciary. *Obshchestvennye nauki i sovremennost* [Social Sciences and Contemporary World], 6, pp. 5-14. (In Russ.).
2. Baranov, P.P., (2014). Modern Problems of the Theory of Constitutional Law and Order in the Russian Federation. *Filosofiya prava* [Philosophy of Law], 4(65), pp. 95-101. (In Russ.).
3. Barber, N.W. and Vermeule, A., (2016). The Exceptional Role of Courts in the Constitutional Order. Harvard Public Law Working Paper, 16-25. Posted: 18 February 2016. Available at: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=2734218>, doi: 10.2139/ssrn.2734218.
4. Barber, N.W., (2001). Prelude to the Separation of Powers. *Cambridge Law Journal*, 60, pp. 59-88. Available at: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=2240838> [Accessed 14.11.2022].
5. Berdnikova, E.V., (2012). Forms of public control in the judicial system of the Russian Federation. *Izvestiya Saratovskogo universiteta, Seriya: Ekonomika, Upravlenie, Pravo*, 12(1), pp. 97-101. (In Russ.).
6. Bezrukov, A.V. and Teplyashin, I.V., (2018). The Role of the Public in Strengthening Constitutional Law and Order in Russia. *Russian Law: Education, Practice, Science*, 3, pp. 36-40. (In Russ.).
7. Bezrukov, A.V., (2017). Constitutional and legal mechanism for ensuring law and order by public authorities in the Russian Federation.

Kutafin Law Review Volume 9 Issue 4 (2022)<https://kulawr.msal.ru/>
660

The Author's Summary of Dr. Sci. (Law) Diss. Ural State Law Academy.
Ekaterinburg. (In Russ.).

8. Bondar, N.S., (2010). Constitutional Court of Russia: Not a "quasi-court", but more than a court. Zhurnal konstitucionnogo pravosudiya [Journal of Constitutional Justice], 3(15), pp. 28-33. (In Russ.).

9. Dzhavakhyan, R.M., (2017). Improvement of forms of citizen participation in the administration of justice as a mechanism of constitutional transformation of the judiciary. Russian Juridical Journal, 2, pp. 45-54. (In Russ.).

10. Dzhavakhyan, R.M., (2018). Constitutional justice, arbitration proceedings and the right to judicial protection. Moscow: De'Libri Publ. (In Russ.).

11. Dzhavakhyan, R.M., (2020). Judicial Power: In Search of Constitutional Balance. Modern Law, 3, pp. 5-14. (In Russ.).

12. Ebzeev, B.S., (2014). Constitution, power and freedom in Russia: The experience of synthetic research. Moscow: Prospekt Publ. (In Russ.).

13. Faroi, T.V., (2018). Qualification collegiums of judges and the problem of the independence of the judiciary in the Russian Federation. Vestnik Tomskoy gosudarstvennoy akademii, 15(2), pp. 130-136. (In Russ.).

14. Flyvbjerg, B., (1998). Habermas and Foucault: Thinkers for Civil Society? The British Journal of Sociology, 49(2), pp. 210-233. Available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2237923>.

15. Golovistikova, A.N. and Grudtsyna, L.Y., (2007). Explanatory

- dictionary of legal terms. Moscow: Eksmo Publ. (In Russ.).
16. Guk, P.A., (2009). Review of Proceedings of the Round Table Legal Policy and Legal Reform in Modern Russia. Gosudarstvo i pravo [State and Law], 4, pp. 106-107. (In Russ.).
17. Khabrieva, T.Y. and Chirkin, V.E., (2005). Theory of the Modern Constitution. Moscow: Norma Publ. (In Russ.).
18. Kokotov, A.N., (2018). Action and realization of the Constitution of Russia of 1993. Vestnik Sibirskogo yuridicheskogo instituta MVD Rossii, 4(33), pp. 14-20. (In Russ.).

<https://kulawr.msal.ru/>

661

- Kutafin Law Review Volume 9 Issue 4 (2022)
- Yurij I. Skuratov, Anna I. Yastrebova, Roman M. Dzhavakhyan
Judiciary and Civil Society in Provision of Constitutional Rule of Law...
19. Law, D.S., (2009). A Theory of Judicial Power and Judicial Review (December 20, 2008). Georgetown Law Journal, 97, p. 723. Available at: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=1112613> [Accessed 14.11.2022].
20. Leist, O.E., (2002). The essence of law. Problems of theory and philosophy of law. Moscow: Zertsalo-M Publ. (In Russ.).
21. Lipchanskaya, M.A., (2012). Participation of citizens in the management of state affairs: Constitutional and legal research. The Author's Summary of Dr. Sci. (Law) Diss. (In Russ.).
22. Lyadnova, E.V., (2010). The right of citizens to participate in the administration of justice: constitutional and legal content and mechanism of implementation. The Author's Summary of Cand. Sci. (Law) Diss. Belgorod State University. Belgorod. (In Russ.).
23. Matuzov, N.I. and Malko, A.V., (2006). Theory of State and

- Law. Moscow: Yurist Publ. (In Russ.).
24. Mishin, A.A., (1984). The principle of separation of powers in the US constitutional mechanism. Moscow: Publishing House "Nauka". (In Russ.).
25. Montesquieu, S., (1955). On the Spirit of Laws: Selected Works. Moscow: Goslitizdat Publ. (In Russ.).
26. Narutto, S.V., (2018). The supremacy of the Constitution as the basis of the constitutional legal order in Russia. Russian Law: Education, Practice, Science, 3, pp. 30-33. (In Russ.).
27. Neves, I.F., (2019). Hermeneutical possibilities to the judicial appreciation of administrative unconstitutional omissions: the control of unconstitutional omissions in contemporary constitutionalism. *Quaestio Iuris*, 12(4), pp. 698-717, doi: 10.12957/rqi.2020.39212.
28. Piatek, W., (2020). Access to the Highest Administrative Courts: between the Right of an Individual to Have a Case Heard and the Right of a Court to Hear Selected Cases. *Central European Public Administration Review*, 18(1), pp. 7-23, doi: 10.17573/cepar.2020.1.01.
29. Rakov, K.A., (2020). Key characteristics of the constitutional legal order. *Vestnik Moskovskogo universiteta MVD Rossii*, 1, pp. 20-22. (In Russ.).
30. Richards, N.M. and King, J., (2014). Big Data Ethics. *Wake Forest Law Review*, 19 May 2014. Available at: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=2384174> [Accessed 14.11.2022].

KUTAFIN

LAW

REVIEW

Kutafin Law Review Volume 9 Issue 4 (2022)<https://kulawr.msal.ru/>
662

31. Rubinina, E.R., (2015). Participation of civil society institutions

- in the administration of justice. *Saratov State Law Academy Bulletin*, 5(106), pp. 111–117. (In Russ.).
32. Rzhetskij, V.A. and Chepurnova, N.M., (1998). *Judicial Power in the Russian Federation: Constitutional Basis of Organization and Activity*. Moscow: Yurist Publ. (In Russ.).
33. Schor, M., (2006). *The Rule of Law*. *Encyclopedia of Law and Society: American and Global Perspectives*, Forthcoming. Suffolk University Law School Research Paper, No. 07-14. Posted: 27 Mar 2006. Available at: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=889472> [Accessed 14.11.2022].
34. Shah, B., (2020). *Executive (Agency) Administration*. *Stanford Law Review*, 72(3), pp. 641–747. Available at: <https://www.stanfordlawreview.org/print/article/executive-agency-administration/> [Accessed 14.11.2022].
35. Shinkarev, A.V., (2006). *Social control in the system of law enforcement by internal affairs bodies*. The Author's Summary of Cand. Sci. (Law) Diss. Moscow. (In Russ.).
36. Skuratov, Y.I., Glazkova, L.V., Grudin, N.S., and Neznamova, A.A., (2016). *The development of organized crime in Russia: A system analysis*. *Russian Journal of Criminology*, 10(4), pp. 638–648, doi: 10.17150/2500-4255.2016.10(4).638-648. (In Russ.).
37. Skuratov, Yu.I., (1996). Chapter 17. In: Kutafin, O.E., editor, (1996). *State Law of the Russian Federation*. Moscow: Juridicheskaya literatura Publ. (In Russ.).
38. Smirnova, V.A., (2006). *The constitutional right of citizens to participate in the administration of justice*. The Author's Summary of Cand. Sci. (Law) Diss. Dostoevsky Omsk State University. Omsk. (In Russ.).
39. Yastrebova, A.I., Salomatkin, A.S., Dzhavakhyan, R.M.,

Redkous, V.M., and Filonov, V.I., (2016). Civil Public Organizations for Providing a Public Order and their Role in Forming of Civil Society. Journal of Advanced Research in Law and Economics, Volume VII, 2(16), pp. 417-425. Available at: <https://journals.aserspublishing.eu/jarle/article/view/229> [Accessed 14.11.2022].

40. Yastrebova, A.I., Stakhov, A.I., Merkulov, P.A., Suchkova, T.Y.,